

Advisory Committee on Standards for Voting Technologies

Committee Meeting

November 30th, 2023, 9:00am – 10:20 am
Sheraton Centre Hotel – 123 Queen St. West, Toronto, ON M5H 3M9

Summary Notes

Committee Attendees In-Person:

- Jean-Pierre Kingsley, Committee Chair
- Dr. Mkabi Walcott, CEO Appointee
- Dr. Nicole Goodman, CEO Appointee
- Donald Eady, Political Party Appointee – New Democratic Party of Ontario
- Karla Webber-Gallagher, Political Party Appointee – New Democratic Party of Ontario
- Christine McMillan, Political Party Appointee – Ontario Liberal Party
- Craig Cantin, Political Party Appointee – Green Party of Ontario
- Fiona Mackintosh, Executive Director of the Advisory Committee
- Stephanie Lowe, Project Manager for the Advisory Committee
- Danjeza Dangli, Policy & Strategic Planning Advisor for the Advisory Committee

Committee Attendees Virtual:

- Dan Duncan, Political Party Appointee – Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario
- Milton Chan, Political Party Appointee – Ontario Liberal Party

Absent:

- Michael Crase, Political Party Appointee – Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario

Guest Attendee Virtual:

- Mike Stockfish, Former Executive Director of the Advisory Committee

Opening Remarks for a Milestone Meeting

- Members approved the October 25th ACSVT meeting minutes.
- Members were provided with an overview of the agenda which included:
 - Finalizing discussion on the ACSVT Final Report and Management Standard;
 - Motion for approving all ACSVT documents;
 - Officially signing the ACSVT Final Report; and,
 - Collecting individual digital signatures of members and final comments.

Final Discussion and Modifications on ACSVT Final Report

- The ACSVT Chair confirmed that all changes requested by the members were incorporated in all documents provided to members. Modifications included the following:
 - Editorial changes were made to correct grammar, punctuation, formatting, and changes to tenses were made to ensure consistency throughout the report.
 - Modification to wording and removal of acronyms to ensure clarity and consistency e.g., “E-Voting/Electronic Voting”, “CEO/Chief Electoral Officer”, “EMB/Electoral Management Body”).
 - Modifications to members’ biographies and the inclusion of the letter from the Chair to the CEO.

- The title of two sections were changed to better reflect their content:
 - Section originally titled “Methodology” has been changed to “Approach”;
 - Section originally titled “Background, Context, and Environmental Scan” has been changed to “Background, Context, and Election Technology History”;
 - The “Executive Summary” section was modified, and excerpts are used to reference each of the three Standards;
 - An additional sentence was added to the “Approach” section to include information about the “Drafting Team” that worked alongside the Technical Committee;
 - Additional details included in the “Balloting Approval Process” section including two separate balloting processes for the Electronic Poll Book and the Vote Tabulator; and
 - Citations added, specifically to enhance the “Election Technology: History of Use” section.
- ACSVT members requested the following final adjustments prior to submission to the CEO:
 - CEO appointee asked about the inclusion of historical implementation of technology by Ontario’s municipalities; Executive Director confirmed that this information has been included;
 - CEO appointee requested that the verbiage pertaining to the Standards Council of Canada be reverted to the original; and
 - CEO appointee requested correction to the number of public comments received for the Electronic Poll Book Product Standard.
- An update to Recommendation #1 to specify that there is no organization responsible for the governance. The change was made because the DGSI is an oversight body, but only for the Product Standards.
- An update to Recommendation #4 acknowledging what is default and standard within government specifying that any change to the *Municipal Elections Act* should require consultation with municipalities.
- An update to Recommendation #5 to add examples of support that Elections Ontario could provide to municipalities using vote tabulators and electronic poll books, if required. Examples of support include, but are not limited to, determining thresholds and rationales for where to implement technology, providing guidance on the placement of technology in a poll, and assisting with preparing technology for use in the election (e.g., programming and imaging).
- The conclusion was updated to highlight that the Standards are iterative and should be reviewed on a pre-determined cycle to make sure that new issues are addressed.
- All the changes proposed above were approved unanimously by the ACSVT members.

Final Discussion and Modifications on Management Standard

- The Executive Director confirmed minor adjustments to the Management Standard to ensure consistency and enhance clarity.
- Adjustments were similar to those made in the ACSVT Final Report such as: grammar, spelling, punctuation, formatting changes, and tense changes for consistency throughout the standard (introductory information is now written in past tense).
- The Executive Director agreed to specify that the Management Standard was developed by the ACSVT and reviewed by the Technical Committee.
- All changes proposed above were approved unanimously by the ACSVT members.

Final Discussion and Modifications on Product Standard

- An Advisory Committee member asked what rights Elections Ontario has with respect to the use of the Product Standards for its business. The member was concerned that copyright would mean there might be an issue with EO's ability to use the Standards. The Executive Director assured the member that there was an agreement made between DGSI and EO and that a perpetual license for use was in place and that DGSI would never charge Elections Ontario for use of the Product Standards.

Members Comments

Separate Motions were passed unanimously to approve:

- The ACSVT Final Report
- Recommendations for Management Standards on Vote Tabulators and Electronic Poll Books.
- DGSI-119-1, Election and Voting Technologies-Part 1: Vote Tabulators (Product Standard).
- DGSI-119-2, Election and Voting Technologies-Part 2: Electronic Poll Books (Product Standard).

Official Signing of the ACSVT Final Report

- Members signed the hard copy of the ACSVT Final Report.
- Members individually signed the ACSVT Member Approval Form.
- Members provided digital signature.

Next Steps

- The Executive Director outlined all next steps for ACSVT members:
 - Concluding French translation of all ACSVT final documents;
 - Content to be converted to comply with AODA requirements;
 - All four ACSVT documents will be submitted to the CEO in early 2024;
 - ACSVT members were informed that they will be notified about the publication date of all standards; and
 - Members were informed that subject-matter experts who participated in the process throughout the past two years will also receive both English and French versions of the published documents.

Closing Remarks

- Thank you message from the Chair and Executive Director.
- Thank you messages from the members.

[The final meeting of the Advisory Committee adjourned at 10:20 a.m.]